

DRAFT MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and the HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

March 17, 2004

Discovery Room at the Science Museum of Virginia
2500 West Broad Street, Richmond, Virginia 23220

State Review Board Members Present

Warren R. Hofstra, Chairman
Ann Field Alexander
Evelyn D. Chandler
Barbara Heath
Carl R. Lounsbury
Wendy L. Price
R. Madison Spencer

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Carter F. McNeely, Chairperson
M. Karen Berkness
Patrick Butler
Rachel O'Dwyer Flynn
True F. Luck
Addison B. Thompson

DHR Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Ann Andrus
Scott Arnold
Robert Carter
David Edwards
Keith Egloff
Joanna Evans

Bryan Green
Jean McRae
Michael Pulice
Sean Smith
Catherine Slusser
Randy Turner
Marc Wagner
Paige Weiss

State Review Board

Chairman Warren R. Hofstra called the State Review Board meeting to order shortly after 10 a.m. in the Discovery Room of the Science Museum of Virginia on Wednesday, March 17, 2004 and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the statement of purpose and the board's procedures, then asked the board members to introduce themselves.

The minutes from the December 3rd, 2003 meeting were approved with a motion from Ann Field Alexander and a second from Carl R. Lounsbury. There was no old or new business.

Historic Resources Board

Chairperson Carter F. McNeely called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. She asked the board members to introduce themselves, then explained the role and purpose of the board.

The minutes from the December 3rd, 2003 meeting were approved with a motion from True F. Luck and a second from Patrick Butler. There was no old business.

Under new business Carter F. McNeely acknowledged the death of fellow preservationist Mr. Martin King and read a Historic Resources Board Resolution regarding the death of Martin Kirwan King. The resolution was passed with a motion from Addison B. Thompson and a second from M. Karen Berkness.

Department of Historic Resources, Director's Report

Director Kathleen Kilpatrick welcomed the board members and everyone in attendance and wished everyone a Happy St. Patrick's Day. She thanked the Science Museum of Virginia's Director, Walter R. T. Witschey, and his staff for hosting the current meeting, then provided some information about the Science Museum and its significance as a state-owned property. She introduced Mr. Witschey who in turn welcomed everyone and provided some visitation statistics for the Museum. He thanked everyone for their support and the Department's use of the facility, then turned the microphone back over to Director Kathleen Kilpatrick.

Director Kilpatrick continued by welcoming Jean McRae as a permanent employee with the Register Program and said goodbye to Ivor Massey, whom previously resigned from the Historic Resources Board.

Director Kilpatrick highlighted activities and events for DHR's past quarter.

- General Assembly: stable funding for next year, Senate funding land conservation, bills passed to prohibit military grave marker sales and to assure family cemetery visitation rights
- Virginia Council of Indians moving under the Secretary of Natural Resources

- NCSHPO annual meeting: discussion included more state authority in reviewing tax credit projects, and ways to strengthen and improve the 106 review process
- Fort Belvoir: Kathleen Kilpatrick asked to serve on the Department of Defense Task Force
- Preserve America: Smithfield and Williamsburg communities designated for preservation achievements
- APVA/PAV Merger: broad terms of agreement for merger, this would create a stronger single statewide organization
- Board Business: reminder of training to be held in Winchester on April 28th, VHS Civil Rights tour postponed until June
- Agenda: Two statewide Multiple Property thematic nominations up for board approval
 - Jefferson Courthouse MPD, acknowledged both Bryan Clark Green and VCU Professor Dr. Charles Brownell for their hard work
 - United Daughters of the Confederacy Jefferson Davis Highway Markers MPD, acknowledged Ruth Snead for her hard work and participation with DHR
- State-Owned Resources – encourage state preservation
 - Staunton River Bridge Fortification on Civil War Fort
 - Sky Meadows State Park
 - Three University of Virginia Buildings
- Other highlights
 - Winchester Region's Crooked Run Valley Rural Historic District
 - Roanoke Region's Buffalo Forge coauthored by John Kern and Michael Pulice
 - Capital Region's Manchester and Broad Street Historic District's expansions for tax credit projects
 - Portsmouth Region's William Rand Tavern, rare 18th century continuous use building in Smithfield
- Markers – emphasis on the rich diversity of Virginia's history
 - Lynchburg City's Pearl S. Buck
 - Stafford County's Moncure Daniel Conway
 - Newport News City's Jessie Menfield Rattley
- Special considerations regarding the Broad Street Commercial Historic District expansion:
 - acknowledgement of objection letters (31 owners total, 13 individual owner objections, 2 adjacent objections)
 - explained the process of public meetings (two were held for this, which is more than typical)
 - benefits of registration – no restrictions just advantages
- Mentioned that owners of the nominated properties could have their pictures taken with their certificates of registration following the morning session

Chairman Hofstra thanked Director Kilpatrick and praised the work of DHR and its staff. He explained the manner of voting for first the State Review Board and then the Historic Resources Board. He said the boards were each provided the opportunity to review the nominations before the meeting and can make comments at the end of each region's presentations.

Joint Session

Jefferson Courthouses National Historic Landmark MPD

Bryan Green presented these under NHL criterion 4 as Jeffersonian designed or influenced courthouses. The MPD includes 15 courthouses of which three are up for approval at this time. Mr. Green acknowledged VCU Professor Dr. Charles Brownell then asked for support from the boards for the three submissions to the national Park Service.

Chairman Hofstra suggested the boards go ahead and vote on the MPD and three nominations at this point. Carl R. Lounsbury requested the MPD include a broader context of National significance – what was happening at the same time across the country? Hofstra explained the board had the option of seeing updated copies of the nominations if they so requested. With a motion from Carl R. Lounsbury and a second from Evelyn D. Chandler, the MPD and three nominations were approved by the SRB to move ahead.

After a comment of appreciation to Dr. Charles Brownell from Addison B. Thompson, the HRB approved the MPD and nominations with a motion from Patrick Butler and a second from True F. Luck.

United Daughters of the Confederacy Jefferson Davis Highway Markers MPD

Ann Andrus presented the (16 marker) MPD and the Maury Street Marker under criterion A and criterion consideration F, and acknowledged Ruth Snead for her contribution and hard work.

The boards approved the MPD and individual nomination at this time with a motion from Wendy L. Price and second from Ann Field Alexander of the SRB, and a motion from Rachel O'Dwyer Flynn and second from Addison B. Thompson of the HRB.

Winchester Region

David Edwards presented the following nominations:

- Boxwood Hill, Rappahannock County (Criteria A and C)
- Contentment, Rockingham County (Criteria A and C)

Crooked Run Valley Rural Historic District, Fauquier County (Criteria A and C), contributing property count of 427
Janney Hill, Town of Hamilton, Loudoun County (Criterion C)
Mannheim, Rockingham County (Criteria A and C)
Oak Hill, Fairfax County (Criterion C)
Shenandoah Historic District, Page County (Criteria A and C), contributing property count of 458
Sky Meadows State Park, Fauquier and Clarke Counties (Criteria A and C)
Walnut Grove, Spotsylvania County (Criterion C)

David Edwards acknowledged the owners and writers of Contentment were present at the meeting.

Chairman Hofstra asked for comments on each nomination first from the audience and then from the board. The following were made:

Crooked Run – Josephine de Give of the Crooked Run Valley Association and a land owner within the district gave her endorsement of the nomination, provided more information, and thanked the board for their support. Barbara Heath, David Edwards, and Architectural Historian, Deborah McClane, discussed the contribution of archaeological sites within the district and the extent of archaeological investigation completed thus far. Wendy L. Price recommended further research and further context for the nomination's areas of significance.

Janney Hill - Warren R. Hofstra asked for a stronger statement of architectural significance and requested that a new copy of the updated nomination be submitted to him for review prior to submission to the keeper.

Mannheim – R. Madison Spencer and Carl R. Lounsbury discussed the influence of Georgian and Germanic designs. Hofstra recommended further historical support for other and more recent similar works.

Shenandoah District - Barbara Heath asked for further research into the inclusion of archaeological sites.

The SRB approved all the nominations and suggestions for the Winchester Region with a motion from Barbara Heath and a second from Carl R. Lounsbury. Addison B. Thompson restated the need for area of significance context on the Crooked Run nomination, then the HRB approved all the nominations with a motion from Addison B. Thompson and a second from True F. Luck.

Roanoke Region

Michael Pulice presented the following nominations:

Bourne-Hale House, Grayson County (Criterion C)
Buffalo Forge, Rockbridge County (Criteria A, C, and D)
Dr. Virgil Cox House, Galax City (Criteria B and C)

Chairman Hofstra asked for comments from either the audience or the board. The following were made:

Buffalo Forge – Warren R. Hofstra acknowledged the referenced book by Charles B. Dew. Evelyn D. Chandler commented on intact slave homes and the complete recordation of both plantation owners and the slaves who worked the complex. Barbara Heath asked about archaeological potential.

The SRB approved all the nominations and suggestions for the Roanoke Region with a motion from Evelyn D. Chandler and a second from R. Madison Spencer. The HRB approved all the nominations with a motion from Patrick Butler and a second from M. Karen Berkness.

Capital Region

Ann Andrus presented the following nominations:

Broad Street Historic District Boundary Increase, City of Richmond (Criterion C)
Clarke-Palmore House Henrico County (Criterion C)
Manchester Industrial Historic District Boundary Increase, City of Richmond (Criteria A and C)
Stanardsville Historic District, Town of Stanardsville, Greene County (Criteria A and C)
Watkins House, Charlotte County (Criteria B and C)

Keith Egloff presented the following nomination:

Staunton River Bridge Fortification, Halifax County (Criteria A, C, and D)

Marc Wagner presented the following nominations:

Memorial Gymnasium, University of Virginia, City of Charlottesville (Criterion C)
Monroe Hill, City of Charlottesville (Criteria A and C)
University of Virginia Observatory, City of Charlottesville (Criteria A and C)

Chairman Hofstra asked for comments from either the audience or the board. The following were made:

Broad Street Expansion – Discussion began with proposals to defer the nomination, pass the nomination as is, or reject the nomination all together. Property owners, Scott Staton and Wayne Shields both spoke of there objection to the district and zoning issues dealing with parking and future development. Property owner, Herb Coleman, and consultant, Nancy Kraus, spoke of there support of the nomination as a tool for the restoration of the neighborhood. Director Kilpatrick recommended further education of objecting owners as to the status of registration and its lack of

enforcements on owners and their properties; rather the registration status was a recognition process with benefits such as tax credits. Several board members reiterated that register status did not control the types of development which may or may not occur within a neighborhood.

Clarke-Palmore – Warren R. Hofstra recommended further enhancement of Virginia's 19th and 20th century building practices.

Stanardsville – Ann Andrus acknowledged the Greene County Architectural Survey Group and their wonderful job of research and education on Stanardsville. Evelyn D. Chandler asked the group to stand for a round of applause.

Watkins House – Patricia Renn, owner of the house, restated the importance of the nomination and thanked the DHR staff and board members for their assistance and consideration.

Memorial Gymnasium – Marc Wagner acknowledged John Zehmer for shepherding the survey and recognition of state-owned buildings. He then proposed adding criterion A for a presidential speech made there in 1940 by F.D.R. This was an accepted addition by both boards. Marc Wagner also recommended statewide significance for these three UVA properties.

Monroe Hill – Marc Wagner thanked R. Madison Spencer for contributing additional notes on the use of this building as an observatory.

Observatory – Marc Wagner thanked R. Madison Spencer for sending a web site link to information on the observatory.

Chairman Hofstra recommended hearing all the Richmond Region nominations, then voting on the Broad Street expansion singularly, the three UVA buildings as a group, and finally the rest of the regional nominations.

The SRB passed deferment of the Broad Street nomination with a motion from Evelyn D. Chandler and a second from Wendy L. Price. With a motion from Patrick Butler and no second, the HRB did not vote on the deferment of the Broad Street nomination. Addison B. Thompson then made a motion to approve the Broad Street nomination and it was seconded by Patrick Butler. Therefore, the Broad Street Historic District Boundary Increase nomination was deferred by the State Review Board (National Register submission) and approved for listing on the Virginia Landmarks Register by the Historic Resources Board. Chairman Hofstra asked if there were any further actions required by the SRB and Director Kilpatrick said not at this time.

The three UVA properties were approved with a motion from Evelyn D. Chandler and a second from Carl R. Lounsbury of the SRB, and a motion from Rachel O'Dwyer Flynn and a second from Addison B. Thompson of the HRB.

The following nominations were approved with a motion from Carl R. Lounsbury and a second from Ann Field Alexander on the SRB, and a motion from True F. Luck and a second from Patrick Butler on the HRB.

Clarke-Palmore, Manchester Industrial Historic District Boundary Increase, Stanardsville Historic District, Watkins House, and the Staunton River Bridge Fortification

Portsmouth Region

Paige Weiss presented the following nominations:

Clifton, Northumberland County

Henry Saunders House, Isle of Wight County

Prospect, Middlesex County

Thomas Murray House, City of Virginia Beach

William Rand Tavern, Town of Smithfield, Isle of Wight County

Chairman Hofstra asked for comments on the nominations. The following were made:

Clifton – Eugene Hudnall from the audience stood up and provided further background information and thanked the board.

Murray House – Carl R. Lounsbury commented on the incorrect use of Dutch Colonial to describe the style.

Rand Tavern - Carl R. Lounsbury commented on the continuous operation of the tavern.

The SRB approved all the nominations and suggestions for the Portsmouth Region with a motion from Barbara Heath and a second from Carl R. Lounsbury. Patrick Butler restated the need for the extension of the Rand Tavern's date range and then the HRB approved all the nominations with a motion from Addison B. Thompson and a second from Patrick Butler.

Chairman Hofstra thanked both boards and adjourned the joint session of the meeting. Owners were then allowed to come to the front and have their pictures taken with the HRB Chairperson, Carter F. McNeely, as they received their certificates of registration.

After lunch, Chairperson McNeely called to order the Historic Resources Board meeting.

Scott Arnold presented the minutes of the Highway Marker Program and explained the process of approval from the board. He stated the City of Winchester local historical marker program would be presented to the Board and asked for approval. Approval was given with a motion from Patrick Butler and a second from True F. Luck. The following markers were then approved with a motion from Rachel O'Dwyer Flynn and a second from True F. Luck:

Sponsor Markers:

Pearl S. Buck, City of Lynchburg
Moncure Daniel Conway, Stafford County
Colonel George Moffett, Augusta County
Jessie Menfield Rattley, Newport News City
TEA-21 Replacement Markers:
Brook Road, E-4, Henrico County
Colonel Fort, E-46, Spotsylvania County and Fredericksburg City
Dorton's Fort, KA-13, Russell County
English Settlement on Gray's Creek, K-319, Surry County (Formerly Settlement on Gray's Creek, K-230)
History of Crouch's creek, K-234

The HRB adjourned and the informal SRB meeting continued next door with the presentation and discussion of PIFs.

Discussion

Hobson Village Historic District, City of Suffolk, DHR File Number 133-5126.

The resource was presented for evaluation under Criteria A (Ethnic Heritage: Black, Maritime History) and C (Architecture) with a POS of 1878-1953. *The Board recommended that the PIF be forwarded to the Keeper for NPS opinion.*

Winchester Region

Dakota, Fauquier Co., DHR File Number 030-0300.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion C with a P.O.S. of 1880-1947. *No Board recommendations.*

Esmé House House, Town of Warrenton, Fauquier Co., DHR File Number 156-0019-0255.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion C with a POS of 1856 and ca. 1900. *No Board recommendations.*

House, 144 South Court Street, Town of Luray, Page Co., DHR File Number 159-5065.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion C with a POS of ca.1892-93. *No Board recommendations.*

Mt. Olive Methodist Episcopal Church, Loudoun Co., DHR File Number 053-0994.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C. *No Board recommendations.*

Purcellville Train Depot, Town of Purcellville, Loudoun Co., DHR File Number 286-5001-0233.

This resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with a POS of 1903-1953. *No Board recommendations.*

Roanoke Region

Boxley-Sprinkle House, City of Roanoke, DHR File Number 128-5978.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion C with a POS of 1908-1954. *No Board recommendations.*

Dante Bank, Russell Co., DHR File Number 083-5119.

The resource is a 1915 brick bank, located in the mining town of Dante. *No Board recommendations.*

East Main Street Historic District Expansion, Town of Christiansburg, Montgomery Co., DHR File Number 154-0001.

This historic district expansion was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion C with a POS of 1905-1954. *No Board recommendations.*

Glen Alton, Giles Co., DHR File Number 035-5024.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with a POS of 1900, 1935. *No Board recommendations.*

Huffman Property, Craig Co., DHR File Number 022-5003.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with a P.O.S. of 1833-1954. *No Board recommendations.*

West Radford Commercial Historic District, City of Radford, DHR File Number 126-5005.

The proposed small historic district was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with a POS of 1890-1954. *No Board recommendations.*

Capital Region

Church Home for the Aged, Infirm, and Disabled Colored People, Brunswick Co., DHR File Number 012-0126.

The resource was evaluated at a statewide level of significance under Criterion A with a POS of ca.1891-1952. *No Board recommendations.*

Colonial Place Christian Church, 4500 Kensington Avenue, City of Richmond, DHR File Number 127-6144.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with Criterion Exception A with a POS of 1913-1953. *No Board recommendations.*

Covesville Rural Historic District, Albemarle Co., DHR File Number 002-5038.

This historic district was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion A with a POS of 1800-1950. *The Board recommends the addition of Criteria C.*

Mineral Historic District, Louisa Co., DHR File Number 054-5029.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under rated under criterion A with the addition of criterion C with a POS of 1890-1950. *No Board recommendations.*

Mount Bernard Complex, Goochland Co., DHR File Number 037-0038.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with a POS of 1850-1950. *The Board recommends the addition of Criteria D.*

Southern Stove Works, City of Richmond, DHR File Number 127-6145.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criteria A and C with a POS of 1915 – 1953. *No Board recommendations.*

Portsmouth Region

Chandler House, Northampton Co., DHR File Number 065-0530.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion C and possible addition of criterion B with a POS of 1890-1935. *No Board recommendations.*

Christian Home School (Rosenwald School), Isle of Wight Co., DHR File Number 046-5053.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion A with a P.O.S. of 1924. *No Board recommendations.*

Franklin Historic District Expansion, City of Franklin, DHR File Number 145-0006.

This historic district expansion was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion A with a POS of 1826-1954.

No Board recommendations.

North Bank Farm, King and Queen Co., DHR File Number 049-0051.

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under rated under criterion C with a POS of 1722-1911. *No Board recommendations.*

Late Addition to PIF Agenda

St. Luke AME Zion Church, City of Franklin, DHR File Number 145-5009

The resource was evaluated as locally significant under Criterion A with a P.O.S. of 1917-1942. *No Board recommendations.*

All PIFs were approved by the State Review Board with recommendations as noted. The unofficial meeting was adjourned.